

ZULFAQAR Journal of Defence Management, Social Science & Humanities



Journal homepage: https://zulfaqarjdmssh.upnm.edu.my/index.php/zjdmssh/index

THE STAGES OF DEVELOPMENT OF RELIGIOUS BEHAVIOR ACCORDING TO AL-GHAZALI, MICHAEL ARGYLE AND FEIERMAN

Nor Nazimi Mohd Mustaffa ^{a,*}, Aminuddin Basir^b, Jaffary Awang^c , Jessica Ong Hai Liaw ^d, Amnah Saayah Ismail^e

- ^a Senior lecturer, Civilization studies, Department of Nationhood, Leadership and Civilisation, Faculty of Defence Studies & Management, National Unersity of Malaysia
- b Acc Prof Agidah & Islamic thought, Islamic civilization, National University of Malaysia
- c Acc Prof Comparative Religion, Sociology of Religion, National University of Malaysia
- ^dAcc Prof Ts Dr Department of Nationhood, Leadership and Civilisation, Faculty of Defence Studies & Management, National Unersity of Malaysia
- ^e Senior Lecturer Dr, Department of Nationhood, Leadership and Civilisation, Faculty of Management and Defence Studies, National Defence University of Malaysia

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received
09-07-2021
Received in revised
03-09-2021
Accepted
13-12-2021
Available online
31-12-2021

Keywords:

behavior, development's stages, human, psychology, religious behavior

e-ISSN: 2773-529X Type: Article

ABSTRACT

Psychologists have conducted empirical studies and observations to explain the development of religious behavior. Psychologists in this field such as Micheal Argyle, Feierman and Ghazali have certainly give their own theories and views in explaining the stages of development of religious behavior. This has certainly been found in many of their books. However, it would be useful to conduct an analysis to find out the views of these religious psychologists and thus be able to conclude about the development stages of religious behavior. Therefore, the objectives of this paper analyzes Argyle, Feierman and Ghazali books which is discusses the question of religious behavior. This study uses qualitative methods through document analysis approach to the work of Religious Behavior from Argyle, Biology of Religious Behavior from Feierman and Ihya Ulum Al-Din from Ghazali. The discussions of all these religious psychologists were analyzed thematically to answer the objectives of the study. The results show that the level of development of religious behavior discussed by Argyle and Feierman is through the stage of development of age from childhood stage to adult's stage. Meanwhile, for Ghazali, he explained that the development stage of religious behavior is through the strength development of soul. The importance of this study is to find out how and why religious behavior is performed by humans.

© Nor Nazimi Mohd Mustaffa 2021. All rights reserved. DOI: https://doi.org/10.58247/jdmssh-2021-0402-14

Introduction

The development of religious behaviour is something we have to pay attention to because it is a reflection of one's religious beliefs. This is understood from Michael Argyle and Feierman explanations in their book which is Religious Behavior and Biology of Religious Behavior. According to Argyle (1958), religious behavior is the implementation of all behaviors that contain elements of supernatural powers and beliefs in those supernatural powers that can be observed and identified differently from other behaviors. While Feierman (2009) state that, religious behaviour is Religious behavior is behavior that is expressed specifically towards religion according to the beliefs of a particular religion. Religious behavior is also a

^{*}Corresponding author: nornazimi@upnm.edu.my

form of behavior that is manifested to manifest their obedience to something they believe to be God. For Western scholars, religious behavior is an outward act of an individual in expressing obedience to religion. For example, the practice of religious ceremonies such as worship, prayer, supplication, attendance at houses of worship, religious festivals, fasting and so on. Religious behaviour also expressed as a person who practices behaviour based on the state of consciousness and the stimulus of belief in the religion he embraces, then that is religious behaviour. Thus, the development of religious behaviour must be taken seriously because it symbolises a religion and its purity.

The development of religious behavior is a very useful thing to be examined so that human beings are clear about the fact of the formation of religious behavior. Religious psychologists have conducted various studies and have come up with their own theories and views on religious behavior and its development. Psychologists such as Micheal Argyle, Feierman and al-Ghazali are among the pioneers in the field of religious behavior. They have done research in explaining their own thinking about the stages of religious behavior development. There is certainly a difference in every view and theory they have come up with. The diversity of views and theories that have been issued by these psychologists shows that there are differences in their thinking in explaining the level of development of religious behavior. Thus, what is the level of development of religious behavior and what are the differences in views of religious psychologists in explaining the level of development of religious behavior. The expected results from this study is the dimensions's stages of religious behavior development. The dimensions's stage of religious behavior development are internal and external dimension.

Methodology

This study uses qualitative methods through document analysis by Michael Argyle's work which is Religious Behavior, Biology of Religious Behavior by Feierman and al-Ghazali's work which is Ihya Ulum al-Din. Thematic approach was applied by organising the theme from their work and and adapted to the research question which is what is the stages of religious behavior. The data were analyzed through document analysis approach to obtain the results (Sabitha Marican, 2009 & Babbie, 2010). The data analysis procedure of this study selects and abstracts the written data to compared the differences (Miles & Huberman (1992)). The data were compared about their views in religious behaviour development stages. After that, this study classifies the dimensions for the stages of religious behavior development and further concludes the findings of the study to explain clearly the stages religious behavior development.

Literatur Review

James (1967) has conducted a study to determine the relationship between religious behavior with personality. This study was conducted on several different religions which is Judaism, Catholicism, Protestantism and Bahá'ís. This study was conducted using a quantitative method by distributing questionnaires to communities, academics and religious groups in Chicago, Illinois and Tulsa, Oklahoma. The results of this study explain that the relationship of religious behavior with personality differences is different according to specific religious groups. In addition, a study was conducted by Marie Cornwall in 1989 entitled The Determinants of Religious Behavior: A Theoretical Model and Empirical Test. This study uses a quantitative method to examine five factors that influence religious behavior. Such factors are group involvement, belief in Orthodoxy, religious commitment, social socialization and sociodemographics of character. This model was tested using data collected from the church. The results show that commitment to religion has the strongest direct impact on religious behavior. Beliefs, personal relationships with society do not directly influence religious behavior.

Seward (1956) has conducted a studies to examine the relationship of religious feelings with religious behaviors such as ritual, charismatic leadership and meditation. This study is qualitative by using 1008 questionnaires and the respondents for this study are students who will be teachers in public schools. Data were analyzed using SPSS software where the results showed that the relationship between religious feelings and ritual ceremonies is the greatest. This is because, the importance of ritual ceremonies is to preserve, strengthen and elaborate on the feelings of faith that a person possesses. The results of this study support that one's faith is guided by ritual practices. Nevertheless, in conclusion faith and ritual practices support each other. Meditation is at the second most important level as a factor to one's religious feelings and charismatic leadership is at the last level as a source of religious feelings.

A study conducted by Darrick (2011) entitled The Multiple Determinants of Religious Behaviors and Spiritual Beliefs on Well-Being. This study examines the diversity of determinants to religious behavior. The variables of happiness, satisfaction in the household and physical health were studied to find out what

the relationship was in religious behavior. This study using quantitative method where the data were taken from the 2008 General Social Survey. Studies show that happiness, satisfaction in the household and physical health have a positive relationship with religious behavior. The study also clarified that individuals who regularly participate in religious ceremonies will make them a religious individual and will increase their levels of happiness and physical health. While, Katie (2013) has studied the effects of social exchange theory on religious behavior. This study uses quantitative method by analyzing data from the general social study and the religious study. Social theories such as trust, repeated exchanges, reputations, information about the exchange of others and institutions. The mechanism of social exchange theory into religious exchange shows a higher level of religious commitment and this in turn explains the theory of social exchange affects religious behavior.

Furthermore, studies conducted related to religious behavior are mostly conducted by authors and researchers from Indonesia. They often use this term with religious behavior that can be understood as religious behavior. Ririn (2010) also conducted a study of the role of spiritual organizations in shaping the religious behavior of students in Yogyakarta. This study uses qualitative method by conducting observations, interviews and documentation of religious high school students in Yogyakarta. Data analysis was done by making comparisons between oral sources and also student behavior and from there conclusions were drawn. The results show that the role of spiritual organizations in shaping the religious behavior of students by religious mentoring and realizing Islamic religious education in schools. Studies show that the formation of religious behavior in religious secondary schools in Yogyakarta is influenced by the role of spiritual organizations in which there is an increase in changes in religious behavior among students after religious activities are held by spiritual organizations.

Next is a studies from Nurhuda (2011) who was conducted a study entitled the relationship between discipline in the military family with religious behavior in adolescents in the dormitory of Garnisun Kota Salatiga in 2011. This study was conducted to aim the relationship between military family discipline and religious behavior. This study uses a quantitative method by conducting a correlation study on the data that has been collected from 47 adolescents in the dormitory. The results showed that there was no positive and significant relationship between the level of military family discipline with the religious behavior of adolescents in the dormitory. Laila (2013) has studied the pattern of formation of religious behavior of students in SMA IT Abu Bakar Yogyakarta conducted by educators in the school. This study is a field study in which data collection is done by means of observations and interviews. The results of the study show that the pattern of religious behavior formation applied from every day religious activities.

Arip (2014) also conducted a study that examined the influence of Islamic religious education in the family, school and community on the religious behavior of students in Yogyakarta. This study uses quantitative method involving a total of 40 students. The analysis was performed using descriptive statistical techniques to test the relationship of the variables in this study. The results show that Islamic education in the family, school and community has a significant influence in the changes of students' religious behavior. Next is a study conducted by Arie (2015) who examined the relationship between understanding of Islam and religious behavior among the community in Indonesia. This study uses a quantitative method by involving 18 residents out of 32 residents there. Data analysis was performed by descriptive analysis and correlation analysis. The results showed that a positive relationship exists between religious behavior and religious understanding of the community in Indonesia.

After reviewing all the previous studies that have been done, neither Western researchers nor researchers from Nusantara, they have not conducted studies specifically on the level of development of religious behavior. Even the researchers did not conduct specific studies according to the views of the psychologists mentioned in this study namely Al-Ghazali, Michael Argyle and Feierman. Therefore, there is an empty space or gap between this study and the studies that have been done by the researchers as mentioned above.

Discussion

The stages of religious behavior development according to Micheal Argyle and Feierman develops according to the age of a person starting from childhood, adolescence to adulthood. They said that, it starts from childhood which is started from three to ten years old where human beings engage in religious behavior activities that are influenced by the environment. Religious beliefs in childhood tend to be like a fairy tale. Children are very interested in the stories found in the Bible and they are so excited about it

(Argyle, 1958). On the other hand, Feierman (2009) explains that experiences experienced as a child influence the formation of one's religious behavior. For example, experience is fined as a form of education. However, fines will only be imposed when a desire is contrary to religion. Therefore, a child needs to suppress desire and something incitement that leads to things that are forbidden in religion.

Then move on to the stage of adolescents which is this is the age of religious revival when a man becomes a religious person or they choose to abandon the religious beliefs during their childhood. According to Argyle 1958 and Feierman 2009, in adolescence period, conversion occurs suddenly as a result of horror and unrealistic feelings of sin and guilt. This change or conversion of religion has made them suddenly transform into a happy, calm and well-mannered person. Religious behavior in adolescence tends to change as a result of an increase in thoughts and emotions such as horror, guilt and so on. An increase in one's level of thinking and mental age also causes adolescents to begin to doubt the religious beliefs received as children. This condition usually occurs at the age of twelve. The symptoms of this conversion usually begin with doubts about religious behavior practiced in a religious institution such as the church and then lead them to disbelief in certain religious beliefs (Argyle, 1958 & Feierman, 2009).

Then the stage of youth is the busiest period in human life because most youths will leave their parents' home, get married, have children and have a career. They have begun to move into a new world which is full of responsible for their own family. This matter has affected the change in religious behavior among youth (Argyle, 1958). According to Feierman (2009), the transfer of a religious belief and religious behavior is achieved through religious ceremonies performed by adolescents. Every religious ceremony aims to transform a child into an adult and the process is during adolescence. At this point, adolescents are at involved in the teaching process to shape their thinking about religion. Adolescents are taught about religious beliefs such as teachings related to symbols, belief in supernatural powers as well as teaching involving emotional learning and social environment. Religious beliefs that have been passed on during adolescence have become a permanent possession when they are in their youth.

Then the last stage which is begins at the age of thirty years. At this age, the increase in religion and religious behavior activities occurs steadily. Usually at this age there are no signs of a decrease in religious behavior activities. Although the rate of attendance at church decreased after the age of eighty due to physical disability, there was an increase in church services obtained through radio medium (Argyle, 1958). After the age of thirty, the pattern of attending church changed, which not only became a habit to somenone but also encouraged their families to attend. Then it changed to maintain the spirit of religion and guarantee the immortality of spiritual life. The increase of religious belief of someone at this age are different from adolescence stages. During adolescent stage, they are in confusion and doubt which is coupled with emotional turmoil. As a result, adolescents change their entire beliefs one way or another all of a sudden. In adulthood, intellect and emotions are dimmed, there are no more worries about religious and there is no more emotional conflict in their religious belief. There is an increase in the practice of religious behavior by the youth because the practice has become commonplace for them (Argyle, 1958).

Thus, what can be understood from the above explanation is religious behavior develops gradually according to the age of an individual. They said that, at the age of three to ten years, the beliefs held by them are fairy tales. After that, at the age of ten to eighteen, humans begin to go through intellectual doubts which is begin to appear at the age of twelve. This intellectual doubts will follow with emotional stress in human life. The conflict in adolescence is only resolved when they have reached the age of sixteen years either to convert or to abandon the religion that was their belief as a child. The most significant decline in religious behavioral activity was in the period of thirty to thirty-five years. The increase in religious behavioral activities became stable during the age of thirty-five and above.

Al-Ghazali (1967) explained that the stages of religious behaviour formation must be through the process of disciplining or training the soul. He emphasizes the six stages of the process which is *musyaratah*, *muraqabah*, *muhasabah*, *mucaqabah*, *mujahadah* and *mucatabah*. The first stages is deliberation process refers to the process of determination and goals. He stressed that this stage is important because it can guide the individual to purify his soul. The determination must be implemented consistently and renewed from time to time. Each individual needs to take the time to determine his or her own resolve and goals. Therefore, each individual needs to allocate time to plan and determine the goals that his soul wants to achieve.

The second stage refers to the process of *muraqabah* which is the process of supervision trained by the individual himself or performed by the educator who ensures that the process is done. After the individual determines the goals and determination to implement a good thing, it needs to be followed by this process. *Muraqabah* is doing something sincerely and maintain the perfection of it. If someone doing something immoral, the person has an attitude of wanting to repent, regret and be ashamed of what he did. The concept of *muraqabah* is in line with the concept of *ihsan* which is to feel the presence of god in everything that is done in daily life. Similarly, *muraqabah* can be achieved through training and always improve one's intentions when doing something or certain jobs so that everything is done solely because of God (al-Ghazali, 1967).

The third stages are the process of reflection which is the process of evaluating or calculating oneself. The concept of repentance expressed in Islam is in line with the spirit of self-reflection. This is because repentance covers the aspect of regret and determination not to repeat the mistakes and sins that was committed before (al-Ghazali, 1967). The fourth stages are $mu^caqabah$ which is the process of punishing oneself for the lack of good deeds and obedience implemented. This stage is in line with the fact that human beings do not escape from committing vices or mistakes. This stage is a way to help individuals to always do good while avoiding immorality. Therefore, this process is understood as a process of insisting on one's own desires. Humans usually tend to punish others for the mistakes they make but not many people punish themselves for the mistakes they make (Al-Ghazali, 1967).

The fifth stages are the process of *mujahadah al-nafs* against the will of lust and the temptations of the devil. In this process, al-Ghazali emphasizes on the process of removing the reprehensible qualities that exist in human beings through specific methods. According to him, every disease is treated with the opposite method of what controls a person. This is because, the darkness that dominates the heart occurs due to the vices committed by humans. Therefore, there is no other method to eliminate the darkness except with the light that results from goodness and every evil is treated with goodness (al-Ghazali, 1967). The last process is *mucatabah* which refers to one's initiative to criticize the soul of *lawwamah* which is somenone feelings of guilt over past sins on oneself. The act of criticizing the soul of *lawwamah* can be raised human soul to a higher level, which is soul of *mutmainnah*. *Mutmainnah* soul is human soul that pleases god and at the same time god pleases himself. *Mucatabah* is the stage where the individual urges his soul to be patient and always warns himself (Al-Ghazali, 1967).

Findings

Table 1: The differences of Development Stages of Religious Behavior between Al-Ghazali, Michael Argyle & Feierman

In gy io a 1 olor man					
	Al-Ghazali	Michael Argyle	Feierman		
Differences	 Internal dimension Soul There are six stages: Determination (musyaratah) Clossness (muraqabah) Self-reflection (muhasabah) Punishment (mucaqabah) Work hard (mujahadah) Self-criticism (mucatabah) 	 Biology dimension Age There are three stages: ✓ Childhood ✓ Adolescence ✓ adulthood 	 Biology dimension Age There are three stages: ✓ Childhood ✓ Adolescence ✓ adulthood 		

Table 2: The similarities of Development Stages of Religious Behavior between Al-Ghazali, Michael Argyle & Feierman

	Al-Ghazali	Michael Argyle	Feierman	
Similarities	Religious awareness			
	 Religious awareness in human beings has a certain level according to the state of mind and changes in human's age 			

Based on the views given by Michael Argyle and Feierman above, both of them explain that religious behavior develops gradually according to the increasing age of an individual. At the age of three to ten years, the beliefs held by them are fairy tales. At the age of ten to eighteen, intellectual doubts begin to appear at the age of twelve, followed by emotional stress. Conflict in adolescence is only resolved when they have reached the age of sixteen years either to convert or to abandon the religion that was their belief as a child. The most significant decline in religious behavioral activity was in the period of thirty to thirty-five years. The increase in religious behavioral activities became steady during the age of thirty-five and above. Meanwhile, according to al-Ghazali, he explained that the stages of religious behavior development is through the stages of training on the soul. He explained that there are three aspects identified in all the above processes which need to be done to strengthen the soul by strengthening faith, enhance worship and apply noble qualities in daily life. Faith is an important thing in human life because it can give a positive effect on the soul. In this process someone needs to increased their worship to God because worship activity plays an important role in assist people overcome problems in life, especially those related to spiritual problems.

The similarity of the views is explained that all three of them agree that the level of development of religious behavior for a person is religious awareness. This can clearly be understood from the age related descriptions of the age dimension stated by Argyle and Feierman. They explain the religious consciousness in a person changes with age. At a young age, religious consciousness is at the level of imagination which then becomes established when it reaches adulthood. For al-Ghazali, the religious consciousness is according to the changing level of one's soul. The soul influences a person to appreciate religion, educate oneself and dedicate oneself to God. Man is determined to obey the orders of religion but at the same time man deviates from the right path to commit mistakes. The soul drives man to blame himself for the wrongs he has committed so that it leads man to strive earnestly to fight the lusts that invite to evil.

So that the results show that the dimension of the level of development of religious behavior is divided into two, namely through the development of age and through the development of the human soul. Through the development of age, religious behavior will change from childhood to adulthood as human reach adulthood. Religious behavior undergoes a phase of change when humans are in their teens. At that point, one begins to understand the beliefs of a religion and then begins to decide on the religion to be followed. Meanwhile, for al-Ghazali, the level of development of religious behavior is through the level of development of one's soul. There are six stages of mental development in determining one's religious behavior. All of these levels need to be passed to strengthen one's faith in religion and then affect the religious behavior of a person. Thus, this study clearly shows that the level of development of religious behavior includes the development of age and the development of the soul. In conclusion, the level of development of religious behavior occurs in two situations towards a human being but so it happens at the same time according to the environmental conditions that a person goes through. Clearly, the two conditions are age and mental development.

Thus, this study explains that, one needs to be aware of the importance of age change and the role of the soul in the development of religious behavior. Therefore, one should pay attention to the surrounding environment inhabited during the development of a certain age because this is what affects one's religious beliefs. In terms of the state of the soul, human beings need to emphasize training and discipline of the soul through worship that has been set in religion. Through such training, the soul will become strong so as to influence the formation of a person's religious behavior. This study contributes to the field of religious psychology in explaining how the development of one's religious behavior. The practical implications

explained in the study are in terms of the role of human beings to pay attention to the developmental phase of age and attention to the training of the soul in ensuring the development of religious behavior is on the right track according to the religious beliefs that have been adhered to. This is important so that people do not stray from the true religious beliefs.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the stage of development of religious behavior is through the increase of age and the development of the human soul. Religious behavior begins with religious beliefs during childhood and then develops during adolescence. Eventually it becomes stable as it reaches adulthood. Age also affects one's soul in practicing the religious beliefs. Referring to al-Ghazali's view which explains that the soul plays a role in one's religious behavior. Religious behavior develops through six stages of training for the soul that human beings need to do. Training and discipline bring human soul closer to God and this influences the development of religious behavior. There are differences and similarities views from al-Ghazali, Argyle and Feierman in discussing the religious behaviour development stages. Their opinion differences classified into two dimensions which is soul dimension discussed by al-Ghazali and age dimension discussed by Argyle and Feierman.

Al-Ghazali states six levels of the soul in the religious behavior development which is determination (musyaratah), clossness (muraqabah), self-reflection (muhasabah), punishment (muccaqabah), hard work (mujahadah) and self-criticism (mucatabah). All of these levels located in the human soul and works according to one's condition at a particular time. These stages motivate human to change to get closer with God and change for the better. The level of the soul discussed by al-Ghazali tends to emphasize on the aspect of consciousness in a person. When a person is aware of his weaknesses then by himself the individual will strive to improve himself to reach a level that is close to God. These soul stages are a process towards the construction of religious behavior that requires constant training of the soul to reach the peak which is termed as intimacy with God.

Argyle and Feierman state about age dimension in religious behaviour development stages. Its begin with childhood and end with adulthood age which is influence the religious behaviour development. The change of age from one stage to another indicates that religious consciousness in human beings is fluctuating. At young age, people recognize religion by the myths that depict God according to the imagination. In adolescence, human beings go through emotional conflicts that drive human beings to think about the truth about their religion. This situation leads people to continue with religious beliefs or leave the religion by choosing another religion. Religious beliefs become established when the age reaches adulthood which affects religious behavior for a person.

References

- Arie Syahfrudi. 2015. A Correlation Study Between the Understanding of Islam and Religious Behavior in the Wild Racing Community in Kembang Village, Nglegi Gunung kidul Village. Master Thesis, Islamic Education, Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University.
- Arip Oktiana. 2014. The Influence of Islamic Religious Education in the Family, School and Community Environment on the Religious Behavior of Class VIII Students of SMP N 9 Yogyakarta. Bachelor Thesis, Faculty of Education and Teaching UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta.
- Argyle, M. (1958). Religious Behavior. London: Routledge House & Kegan Paul Ltd.
- Darrick Tovar Murray. 2011. The Multiple Determinants of Religious Behaviors and Spiritual Beliefs on Well-Being. *Journal of Spirituality in Mental Health* 13:182–192.
- Feierman, J. R. (2009). *The Biology of Religious Behavior: The Evolutionary Origins of Faith and Religion*. California: Praeger.

- al-Ghazali, Imam Abi Hamid Muhammad Bin Muhammad al-Ghazali. (1967). *Ihya' cUlum al-Din.* Qahirah: Mu'assah al-Halabi wa Syarikah li al Nasyri^c wa at-Tauzi^c.
- James J. Keene. 1967. Religious Behavior and Neuroticism, Spontaneity and Worldmindedness. *Journal of American Sosiological Association* 30(2): 137-157.
- Katie E. Corcoran. 2013. Devine Echanges: Applying Social Exchange Theory to Religious Behavior. *Journal of Rationality and Society* 25(3): 335-369.
- Laila Nur Wahyuni. 2013. Patterns of Formation of Multicultural Behavior of Learners in SMA IT Abu Bakar Yogyakarta. Bachelor Thesis, Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University, Indonesia. Marie Cornwall. 1989. The Determinants of Religious Behavior: A Theoretical Model and Empirical Test. *Social Force* 68(2): 572-592.
- Miles, M.B dan Huberman A. M. (1992). Qualitative Data Analysis: A Sourcebook of New Methods. Beverly Hills: Sage.
- Nurhuda Sandi Utomo. 2012. The Relationship Between Discipline In Military Families With Religious Behavior In Adolescents In The Salatiga City Garrison Dormitory In 2011. Master Thesis, Salatiga State Islamic Religious High School.
- Ririn Astuti. 2010. The Role of Islamic Spiritual Organization (ROHIS) in Shaping the Religious Behavior of Students in SMA Negeri 1 Godean Sleman Yogyakarta. Bachelor Thesis, Faculty of Education and Teaching UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta.
- Sabitha Marican. (2005). Social science research methods. Selangor: Pearson Prentice Hall.
- Seward, W. Salisbury. 1956. Faith, Ritualism, Charismatic Leadership and Religious Behavior. *Oxford Journals* 34(3): 241-245.